

A False story about the wife of Umar raising her voice at him

بِسْمِ اللَّهِ الرَّحْمَنِ الرَّحِيمِ

Compiled by Rasheed Barbee

The narration: “It was mentioned that a man came to Umar ibn al Khattab to complain about the character of his wife. As he stood at the door waiting for Umar, he heard the wife of Umar scolding Umar while he was silent and did not respond. The man turned away and left while saying ‘if this is the condition of Umar ibn al Khattab the leader of the believers then how about my condition’?”

Some women use this story as justification to scream at their husbands.

Here are some reasons this story has been declared unauthentic and weak.

Weakness of Hadith: This narration does **not** have a chain of narration, rather it appears as follows

فقد ذُكِرَ أَنَّ رَجُلًا جَاءَ إِلَى عُمَرَ يَشْكُو إِلَيْهِ

It was ‘mentioned’ that a man came to Umar complaining to him

This type of narration is called ‘Tamrid’. The narrator of the Hadith is not mentioned by name, rather it reads ambiguously in the grammatical passive voice ‘it was mentioned, or it was narrated’. This type of Hadith is weak as stated by Imam Nawawi and Imam Albani.

I contacted Shaykh Muhammad Ghalib and he confirmed this narration has no basis and is not authentic.

Status of Umar ibn al-Khattab رضي الله عنه: Men, women, children, even Satan, feared Umar, so the thought that his wife would scream on him such that those outside his home would hear it, contradicts the manner in which people interacted with Umar.

Satan was afraid of Umar: The Prophet (ﷺ) said, ‘O Umar indeed Satan is afraid of you!’ (Jami Tirmidhi) The Prophet (ﷺ) said: ‘O Ibn al-Khattab, by Him in Whose Hands my life is, whenever Satan sees you taking a path, he follows a path other than yours!’ (Sahih al-Bukhari)

Men revered Umar: Ibn Abbas said, ‘I waited for an entire year to ask Umar ibn al-Khattab a question concerning a verse in the Quran, but I could not ask him due to the reverence I have for him’. (Sahih al-Bukhari). Amr bin Maimun said, ‘I prayed with Umar the day he was stabbed, and nothing prevented me from praying in the first row except due to my reverence of him, he was frightening man’. (Sahih al-Bukhari)

Women revered Umar: Sa'd said, 'Umar bin al-Khattab asked permission of the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) to enter while some women from Quraysh were sitting asking him to give them more financial support as they raised their voices over the voice of the Prophet (ﷺ). When Umar asked permission to enter, all of them hurried to screen themselves (out of fear). (Sahih al-Bukhari)

The Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) went out for one of his expeditions, when he came back, a black girl came to him and said: 'O Messenger of Allah, I took an oath that if Allah returned you safely, I would beat the duff before you.' So, the Messenger of Allah (ﷺ) said to her: 'If you have taken an oath, then beat it, and if you have not then do not.' So, she started to beat the duff, and Abu Bakr entered while she was beating it. Then Ali entered while she was beating it, then Uthman entered while she was beating it. Then Umar entered, so she put the duff under her, and sat upon it. (Jami Tirmidhi)

Status of the women companions and the wife of Umar: She is the noble companion Umm Kulthoom the daughter of Ali ibn Abi Talib and Fatimah. It was not the practice of these noble women to yell at their husbands. As Shaykh Uthaymeen said, 'the woman yelling at her husband is from bad manners'.

Therefore, beware of using a weak narration to justify your position or to pass time sharing an anecdote, especially if it involves a slight towards the character of the noble companions.